

August 26, 2005

Devich Farbotnik

Thank you for submitting all the documentation for 2004. There were 4 reports which were not accepted. These are a Thayer's Gull on 14 December, a California Gull on 27 October, a Sharp-tailed Sparrow on 9 October, and a Pink-footed Goose on 16 November. Also the committee nearly unanimously voted to place your father's report of a White Ibis on 3 March at his farm in **Class IV-B**: A record for which there exists insufficient evidence for evaluation, simply because the description of the call note was all that really clinched the bird and no-one felt the description was diagnostic.

Of these, the Goose and the Sharp-tailed Sparrow were simply not clear enough on the video to be identified. The Sparrow is obviously a Sharp-tailed and will be accepted as that, but no-one could tell from the video if it was a Nelson's or a Saltmarsh. The committee accepted the Thayer's 2-1, but 4 members abstained from voting, including me. In my comments I noted that I saw the bird and called it a Thayer's. The committee essentially doesn't know what to do with young Thayer's and are deferring judgement on these birds until a better understanding of where the plumage, morphological, and taxonomic limits between Kumlien's and Thayer's lie (basically passing the buck).

The California Gull was the toughest decision. Personally I am not sure I could rule out a large (most likely female) Ring-billed Gull. First year Ring-billed Gulls can look very like California Gull and have a similar molt pattern, the range of variation between juvs and 1<sup>st</sup> winters can match the range of variation in 2<sup>nd</sup> cycle California Gulls. Some Ring-bills will retain juvenile wing coverts through the first winter, and some will lose almost all coverts and look more like a 2<sup>nd</sup> yr bird. Also the bill on the bird looked, pink-based in the video which would suggest a Ring-billed since California Gulls should lose the pink base in the first year, and have a yellower bill base. Basically everyone felt that a clearer look to reveal the fine plumage features was needed, and that eye-color alone was not enough to clinch the ID.

Thanks again for sending in all the documentation.

Sincerely

Matt Sharp

Chair: Pennsylvania Ornithological Records Committee.

# Pennsylvania Ornithological Records Committee

## Tabulation Form - Round One

Species: Pink Footed Goose (*Anser brachyrhynchus*)

Date of Sighting: 16 November 2002 to 16 November 2002

Location: CORE CREEK PARK

County: BUCKS

Observer(s): Devich Farbotnik

Date of Submission: 2002

Submitted by: Devich Farbotnik

Written Description: No

Photo: No

Specimen: No

Recording: Video

Member	Class I	Class II	Class III	Class IV-A				Abstain
					Class IV-B	Class IV-C	Class V	
R. W. Trout								
<del>G. Armistead</del>				X				
D. Heathcote	X							
P. Guris					X			
J. Stanley				X				
E. Witmer	X							
B. Leberman	X							
M. Sharp					X			
TOTALS	2			2	2			
DECISION				X				

Comments:

2/4

Signature (Secretary): Date:



2/20/08